

Date: September 26, 2018

To: Employees' Retirement System of Rhode Island (ERSRI)

From: Pension Consulting Alliance, LLC (PCA)

RE: Functional Asset Allocation - Inflation Protection Class

Core Real Estate Sub Portfolio Recommendation:

PRISA Fund

## **Background**

Effective with the 2017-18 fiscal year, ERSRI implemented a revised asset allocation. As part of this change, private core real estate investments will serve as a portion of the Inflation Protection allocation. Previously, the System had categorized real estate as a distinct asset class, and had an allocation target of 8% of total ERSRI portfolio assets. These investments permitted private and public real estate, diversified by core risk and non-core risk investments, as well as by geography and property type. Currently, all of ERSRI's real estate holdings are in a series of open and closed end private commingled funds. As of March 31, 2018, approximately 8.3% of plan assets were invested and committed to invest in real estate. Approximately 63% of the invested and committed amounts are in five core funds totaling \$432.8 million and 69% of total NAV, and 37% are invested and committed to 11 non-core funds totaling \$258.7 million and 31% of NAV.

As part of the new functional asset class portfolio structure, core open-end funds are included within the Inflation Protection class. The target NAV of this sub-portfolio is intended to be reduced, in a gradual process, to 3.6% of the total ERSRI portfolio. It is currently estimated that a reduction of approximately \$80 million will assist ERSRI in achieving its core real estate target allocation within the Inflation Protection class.

PCA has worked with Staff in examining the System's core real estate investments and recommends that ERSRI redeem its \$77.3 million investment balance (as of June 30, 2018) in the Prudential Insurance sponsored open end fund. ERSRI made its initial investment in PRISA in 2005.

## Merits/Strengths for Redemption

- A redemption from the PRISA fund would reduce the number of core real estate managers from five to four and will provide more efficient supervision of the portfolio. The SIC and Staff's human resources are constrained, and the ability to invest with a smaller number of managers enhances oversight.
- When viewed ex ante, redeeming the PRISA interest does not reduce the overall diversification by geography or property type in an adverse manner by creating concentrations, nor reduce the rate of income return which is distributed quarterly to ERSRI.
- The current management fee ERSRI is charged by the PRISA fund is the highest of all ERSRI's core fund investments. ERSRI is not only sensitive to a Fund's fee structure, but the PRISA fund most recently raised management fees while other funds have lowered fees.



- As of March 31, 2018, PRISA's gross total return in comparison to the NFI-ODCE benchmark outperformed for the current quarter and on a trailing one-, three-, and five-year basis, and underperformed for the ten-year period. The loan-to-value (LTV) ratio during the first quarter 2018 was below the NFI-ODCE benchmark LTV of 21.1%. During the financial crisis in 2008-09, PRISA underperformed ERSRI's other core funds.
- PRISA has historically not been rewarded by meaningful excess risk adjusted returns for its forays into non-core investments such as new development.

Figure 1 Since Inception Net Total Returns (1), (2)

rigare i		
Fund Name	ERSRI Since Inception Net Total Return	NFI-ODCE Since Inception Net Total Return
AEW Core Property Trust	12.0%	10.6%
Heitman America Real Estate Trust	9.6%	9.6%
JP Morgan Strategic Property Fund	6.2%	5.9%
Morgan Stanley Prime Property Fund	7.8%	6.4%
Prudential PRISA	6.0%	6.4%

As of March 31, 2018

<sup>(1)</sup> ERSRI's since inception net total returns shown will differ from each respective fund's since inception net total return due to different management fee structures, different initial capital call dates from ERSRI and different inception dates of each respective fund.

<sup>(2)</sup> The since inception NFI-ODCE Index net total returns shown are based on ERSRI's inception date for each respective fund.



DISCLOSURES: This document is provided for informational purposes only. It does not constitute an offer of securities of any of the issuers that may be described herein. Information contained herein may have been provided by third parties, including investment firms providing information on returns and assets under management, and may not have been independently verified. The past performance information contained in this report is not necessarily indicative of future results and there is no assurance that the investment in question will achieve comparable results or that the Firm will be able to implement its investment strategy or achieve its investment objectives. The actual realized value of currently unrealized investments (if any) will depend on a variety of factors, including future operating results, the value of the assets and market conditions at the time of disposition, any related transaction costs and the timing and manner of sale, all of which may differ from the assumptions and circumstances on which any current unrealized valuations are based.

Neither PCA nor PCA's officers, employees or agents, make any representation or warranty, express or implied, in relation to the accuracy or completeness of the information contained in this document or any oral information provided in connection herewith, or any data subsequently generated herefrom, and accept no responsibility, obligation or liability (whether direct or indirect, in contract, tort or otherwise) in relation to any of such information. PCA and PCA's officers, employees and agents expressly disclaim any and all liability that may be based on this document and any errors therein or omissions therefrom. Neither PCA nor any of PCA's officers, employees or agents, make any representation of warranty, express or implied, that any transaction has been or may be effected on the terms or in the manner stated in this document, or as to the achievement or reasonableness of future projections, management targets, estimates, prospects or returns, if any. Any views or terms contained herein are preliminary only, and are based on financial, economic, market and other conditions prevalling as of the date of this document and are therefore subject to change.

The information contained in this report may include forward-looking statements. Forward-looking statements include a number of risks, uncertainties and other factors beyond the control of the Firm, which may result in material differences in actual results, performance or other expectations. The opinions, estimates and analyses reflect PCA's current judgment, which may change in the future.

Any tables, graphs or charts relating to past performance included in this report are intended only to illustrate investment performance for the historical periods shown. Such tables, graphs and charts are not intended to predict future performance and should not be used as the basis for an investment decision.

All trademarks or product names mentioned herein are the property of their respective owners. Indices are unmanaged and one cannot invest directly in an index. The index data provided is on an "as is" basis. In no event shall the index providers or its affiliates have any liability of any kind in connection with the index data or the portfolio described herein. Copying or redistributing the index data is strictly prohibited.

The Russell indices are either registered trademarks or tradenames of Frank Russell Company in the U.S. and/or other countries.

The MSCI indices are trademarks and service marks of MSCI or its subsidiaries.

Standard and Poor's (S&P) is a division of The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc. S&P indices, including the S&P 500, are a registered trademark of The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc.

CBOE, not S&P, calculates and disseminates the BXM Index. The CBOE has a business relationship with Standard & Poor's on the BXM. CBOE and Chicago Board Options Exchange are registered trademarks of the CBOE, and SPX, and CBOE S&P 500 BuyWrite Index BXM are servicemarks of the CBOE. The methodology of the CBOE S&P 500 BuyWrite Index is owned by CBOE and may be covered by one or more patents or pending patent applications.

The Barclays Capital indices (formerly known as the Lehman indices) are trademarks of Barclays Capital, Inc.

The Citigroup indices are trademarks of Citicorp or its affiliates.

The Merrill Lynch indices are trademarks of Merrill Lynch & Co. or its affiliates.

FTSE is a trademark of the London Stock Exchange Group companies and is used by FTSE under license. All rights in the FTSE indices and/or FTSE ratings vest in FTSE and/or its licensors. No further distribution of FTSE data is permitted without FTSE's express written consent.

## Supplement for real estate and private equity partnerships:

While PCA has reviewed the terms of the Fund referred to in this document and other accompanying financial information on predecessor partnerships, this document does not constitute a formal legal review of the partnership terms and other legal documents pertaining to the Fund. PCA recommends that its clients retain separate legal and tax counsel to review the legal and tax aspects and risks of investing in the Fund. Information presented in this report was gathered from documents provided by third party sources, including but not limited to, the private placement memorandum and related updates, due diligence responses, marketing presentations, limited partnership agreement and other supplemental materials. Analysis of information was performed by PCA.

An investment in the Fund is speculative and involves a degree of risk and no assurance can be provided that the investment objectives of the Fund will be achieved. Investment in the Fund is suitable only for sophisticated investors who are in a position to tolerate such risk and satisfy themselves that such investment is appropriate for them. The Fund may lack diversification, thereby increasing the risk of loss, and the Fund's performance may be volatile. As a result, an investor could lose all or a substantial amount of its investment. The Fund's governing documents will contain descriptions of certain of the risks associated with an investment in the Fund. In addition, the Fund's fees and expenses may offset its profits. It is unlikely that there will be a secondary market for the shares. There are restrictions on redeeming and transferring shares of the Fund. In making an investment decision, you must rely on your own examination of the Fund and the terms of the offering.